



City of Pensacola

City Council Special Meeting

Agenda - Final

Tuesday, July 14, 2020, 5:30 PM

Council Chambers, 1st Floor

- Members of the public may attend and participate only via live stream or phone [cityofpensacola.com/428/Live-Meeting-Video](https://www.cityofpensacola.com/428/Live-Meeting-Video) or [facebook.com/PensacolaMayor](https://www.facebook.com/PensacolaMayor)
- Citizens may submit an online form here <https://www.cityofpensacola.com/ccinput>
12PM UNTIL 5:15 PM

ROLL CALL

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ACTION ITEMS

1. [20-00365](#) HISTORICAL CONTEXT REVIEW OF THE LEE SQUARE CONFEDERATE MONUMENT AND EQUITABLE CONSIDERATION OF ALL PARTIES

Recommendation: That City Council authorize the removal of the Lee Square Confederate Monument. Further, that City Council authorize the Mayor to take all actions necessary to award a contract for the removal and disposition of the monument.

Sponsors: Grover C. Robinson, IV, Sherri Myers

Attachments: [Confederate Monument Staff Report](#)
2. [20-00337](#) REQUEST FOR THE RENAMING OF LEE SQUARE TO FLORIDA SQUARE

Recommendation: That City Council approve the request to rename Lee Square back to Florida Square.

Sponsors: Grover C. Robinson, IV

Attachments: [Unapproved June 18, 2020 Parks and Recreation Board Minutes](#)
[Staff Memo regarding Florida Square 1858 Map](#)
[1858 Map of Florida Square](#)

ADJOURNMENT

If any person decides to appeal any decision made with respect to any matter considered at such meeting, he will need a record of the proceedings, and that for such purpose he may need to ensure that a verbatim record of the proceedings is made, which record includes the testimony and evidence upon which the appeal is to be based.

The City of Pensacola adheres to the Americans with Disabilities Act and will make reasonable accommodations for access to City services, programs and activities. Please call 435-1606 (or TDD 435-1666) for further information. Request must be made at least 48 hours in advance of the event in order to allow the City time to provide the



Memorandum

File #: 20-00365

City Council

7/14/2020

LEGISLATIVE ACTION ITEM

SPONSOR: Grover C. Robinson, IV, Mayor
City Council Member Sherri Myers

SUBJECT:

HISTORICAL CONTEXT REVIEW OF THE LEE SQUARE CONFEDERATE MONUMENT AND
EQUITABLE CONSIDERATION OF ALL PARTIES

RECOMMENDATION:

That City Council authorize the removal of the Lee Square Confederate Monument. Further, that City Council authorize the Mayor to take all actions necessary to award a contract for the removal and disposition of the monument.

HEARING REQUIRED: No Hearing Required

SUMMARY:

On June 11, 2020, the City Council introduced discussion on the Lee Square Confederate monument and initiated a 30-day waiting period for potential action.

Staff was asked to consider:

- 1) Is the Square in its current format equitable and representative to all the citizens of our community?

Under careful consideration and with Pensacola's collective heritage and historic landscape in mind, staff has determined that Lee Square and the monument does not reflect our current values nor strive to create a more inclusive City. Although the Confederate monument remembers those that lead, fought, and died for the Confederacy, it also promotes a post-Reconstruction "Lost Cause" narrative that memorializes a divisive time in American history reflective of "white supremacy" and the Jim Crow era. The Square and monument are not equitable representations of all our citizens. To achieve a stronger and more unified community, staff recommends the complete removal of the Lee Square Confederate monument.

- 2) If not: can the square be altered and made equitable to all parties of our community?

Staff strove to answer the questions in the context of our current citizens and our diverse ancestral histories through which they come to our community. We are essentially all descendants of either

Native Americans, free African slaves, Confederate soldiers and families, Union soldiers and families, immigrants, or some combination of those groups. As we celebrate 200 years of Florida being a part of the United States next year, we desire a place where all of us feel we are represented with equity.

3) If yes, how much would it cost to do so?

The final design would determine the cost. Like and equitable replacement of the current monument representing all our ancestries would be cost-prohibitive, likely more than \$10,000,000.

4) Then for staff to recommend ways the Square can be made equitable to all parties.

Rather than spending millions on memorializing our past, we should invest towards creating a better future by bringing people together. We recommend bringing the square reuse consideration back to Council in August to discuss and determine a means moving forward to bring unity and equitable recognition to all the people of our community.

It is through this lens staff prepared the attached report and recommendations. The report provides a brief history of Lee Square, a historic resource analysis of the monument, and various aesthetic options for the square if the monument is removed or relocated.

PRIOR ACTION:

June 11, 2020 - City Council introduced discussion on the Lee Square Confederate Monument and initiated a 30-day waiting period for potential action.

FUNDING:

N/A

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

Currently, sufficient funds are available in the Parks & Recreation Department for the immediate removal of the monument. However, once a contract has been awarded and final costs are known, a supplemental budget resolution will be brought before City Council to appropriate the funds for the removal of the monument.

CITY ATTORNEY REVIEW: Yes

7/6/2020

STAFF CONTACT:

Keith Wilkins, City Administrator

ATTACHMENTS:

1) Confederate Monument Staff Report

PRESENTATION: No

MEMORANDUM

To: Mayor Grover Robinson, IV

From: Keith Wilkins, City Administrator

Date: July 7, 2020

Re: Historical context review of the Lee Square confederate monument and equitable consideration of all parties.

Recommendation: That City Council approve the removal of the Lee Square Confederate Monument and to give the Mayor the authorization to award a contract to implement Council's approval.

Background: On June 11, 2020, the City Council introduced discussion on the Lee Square Confederate Monument and initiated a 30-day waiting period for potential action. Staff was asked to consider:

- 1) Is the Square in its current format equitable and representative to all the citizens of our community?

Under careful consideration and with Pensacola's collective heritage and historic landscape in mind, staff has determined that Lee Square and the monument does not reflect our current values nor strive to create a more inclusive City. Although the Confederate monument remembers those that lead, fought and died for the Confederacy, it also promotes a post-Reconstruction "Lost Cause" narrative that memorializes a divisive time in American history reflective of "white supremacy" and the Jim Crow era. The Square and Monument are not equitable representations of all our citizens. To achieve a stronger and more unified community, **staff recommends the complete removal of the Lee Square Confederate monument.**

- 2) If not: can the square be altered and made equitable to all parties of our community?

Staff strove to answer the questions in the context of our current citizens and our diverse ancestral histories through which they come to our community. We are essentially all

descendants of either Native Americans, free African slaves, Confederate soldiers and families, Union soldiers and families, immigrants, or some combination of those groups. As we celebrate 200 years of Florida being a part of the United States next year, we desire a place where all of us feel we are represented with equity. **Staff recommends, the Square cannot be altered using its current memorial and be equitable to all parties of our community.** Any use of the current obelisk, base or statue, in our opinion will be reminiscent of the former memorial and not inclusive or equitable to all community members. Equitable monument(s) in this location is not financially or logistically feasible.

3). If yes, how much would it cost to do so?

Cost would be determined by the final design. Like and equitable replacement of the current monument equitably representing all our ancestries would be cost prohibitive, likely in excess of \$10,000,000.

4) Then, for staff to recommend ways the Square can be made equitable to all parties.

Rather than spending millions on memorializing our past, we should invest towards creating a better future by unifying our entire community and bringing people together. **We recommend bringing the Square reuse consideration back to Council in August to discuss and determine a means moving forward to bring unity and equitable recognition to all the people of our community.**

Attachments

Staff Report Concerning “The Confederate Monument” at “R. E. Lee Square”: It is through this lens staff prepared the attached report and recommendations. The attached Staff Memorandum provides a brief history of Lee Square, a historic resource analysis of the monument and various aesthetic options for the square if the monument is removed or relocated.

Cost Estimates: The attached Cost Estimates consider:

- 1) the cost to remove and warehouse the entire monument;
- 2) the cost to remove and install the entire monument at another location not yet determined;
- 3) the cost to remove the top statue, cover current inscriptions and remove the engraved text “Our Confederate Dead”.

STAFF REPORT

Date: July 7, 2020

Re: Staff Report Concerning “The Confederate Monument” at “R. E. Lee Square”

Summary

On June 11, 2020, the City Council introduced discussion on the Lee Square Confederate monument and initiated a 30-day waiting period for potential action. Soon after, staff was asked to consider whether Lee Square’s current form is representative of all citizens and if not, to recommend ways that the Square can be made equitable to all parties. Under careful consideration and with Pensacola’s collective heritage and historic landscape in mind, staff has determined that Lee Square does not reflect our current values nor our strive to create a more inclusive City. Although the Confederate monument remembers those that fought and died in our county, it also promotes a post-Reconstruction “Lost Cause” narrative that memorializes a divisive time in American history. To achieve a stronger and more unified community, staff recommends the complete removal of the Lee Square Confederate monument. The following report provides a brief history of Lee Square, a historic resource analysis of the monument and various aesthetic options for square if the monument is removed or relocated.

A Brief History of the Confederate Monument at Lee Square

Prior to the reconfiguration of Lee Square in the 1960s, the park consisted of a square-shaped plaza in which Palafox Street broke at Gadsden and Jackson Streets to form the west and east boundaries of the square, much like present-day Alabama Square. The square was renamed from Florida Square to “R. E. Lee Square” in honor of the late commander of the Confederate States Army on June 4, 1887.¹ The square’s prominent location on Gage Hill overlooks Pensacola and the bay, and it is one that has been used throughout Pensacola’s history. The British fortifications Fort George, the Queen’s Redoubt and the Prince of Wales Redoubt were constructed in the area during the late 1770s and early 1780s and earlier components of Spanish Fort San Miguel may be present.² Lee Square is also believed to be the site of Fort McClellan, an earthwork fortification constructed by Union troops after their occupation of Pensacola in 1862.³ An

archaeological survey at Lee Square by the University of West Florida in April 1986 recovered artifacts associated to the British-period and/or Civil War-period activity.⁴

The idea of the Lee Square monument was initially spurred by General E. A. Perry who served in the Confederate States Army and as Governor of Florida between the years 1885-1889. In a June 1881 appeal, Perry called attention to the fact that out of all the states which had seceded, Florida “had neglected to raise a monument to those who, in obedience to her mandate, gave up their lives in the late war”. In response, approximately \$3,000 was raised, presumably by Perry and his wife, for a monument to be designed and placed in Tallahassee. Perry died on October 15, 1889. On April 22, 1890, William Chipley who served as Pensacola’s Mayor from 1887-1888 wrote, “It is well known that the fund in the hands of Mrs. Perry was received entirely through the efforts of our lamented Governor and his patriotic wife”. According to the Confederated Southern Memorial Association, the letter also revealed that Mrs. Perry wished to be relieved of the care of the fund, but that she also be asked, “not to relinquish the fund, but to associate with herself, if she desires them to assist in the labor, four other ladies, whom she may select, and that they be requested to secure plans for a granite pile, more enduring than marble, or a final cost of not exceeding \$7,500.00, that the work be commenced at once in the center of R. E. Lee Square, in front of Public School No. 1, when coming generations will learn, with their daily lessons, to honor our beloved dead. The completion of the monument will be a charge upon the survivors and the ladies”.⁵

On November 5, 1890, Lee Square was officially placed under the charge of the ladies of the Confederate Monument Association, with powers to erect a Confederate monument.⁶ The dedication ceremony was planned to be on the anniversary of Jefferson Davis’s birthday on January 3, 1891. However, the ceremony was postponed to June 17, 1891, due to delays. An estimated ten thousand people were in attendance.⁷

The monument is constructed from Virginia granite and is reported to be around thirty feet tall. At its top is an eight-and-a-half-foot statue of a Confederate soldier which is faced south towards downtown Pensacola. The statute is the reproduction of a bronze figure erected in Alexandria, Virginia, which was modeled from the painting *Appomattox* by John Adams Elder and hung in the Capitol at Richmond. Resting below the statue and obelisk is a truncated pyramid whose four faces are inscribed in memory of “the uncrowned heroes of the Southern Confederacy”, Jefferson Davis, E. A. Perry and Stephen R. Mallory. Although Jefferson Davis did not have known ties to Pensacola, Mallory and Perry did. Mallory served as secretary to the Confederate Navy from 1861 to

1865 and moved to Pensacola to practice law following the war. He died in 1873 and is buried in Historic St. Michael's Cemetery. Perry lived in Pensacola during the 1850s and returned after the war. Perry died in 1889 and is buried in St. Johns Cemetery.⁸ The recognition of Jefferson Davis is interesting since his death in 1889 occurred only two years before the monument was erected. The Southern Memorial Association states, "in passing, [the Lee Square monument] was the first monument wholly or in part erected to the memory of the Confederate President".⁹

The following text is displayed on the south (front), west, north, and east faces, respectively:

A.D. 1861 A.D. 1865
THE UNCROWNED HEROES
OF THE
SOUTHERN CONFEDERACY.

WHOSE JOY IT WAS TO SUFFER AND DIE FOR A CAUSE THEY BELIEVED TO BE JUST. THEIR
UNCHALLENGED DEVOTION AND MATCHLESS HEROISM SHALL CONTINUE TO BE THE WONDER AND
INSPIRATION OF THE AGES.
OUR CONFEDERATE DEAD

EDWARD AYLESWORTH PERRY.
CAPTAIN OF THE PENSACOLA 'RIFLES', COLONEL OF THE SECOND FLORIDA REGIMENT, GENERAL
OF THE FLORIDA BRIGADE IN THE ARMY OF NORTHERN VIRGINIA. AMONG THE FIRST TO
VOLUNTEER IN THE DEFENSE OF HIS ADOPTED STATE. FAITHFUL IN EVERY POSITION TO WHICH
HIS MERIT ADVANCED HIM. HIS LIFE AND DEED CONSTITUTE HIS BEST MONUMENT.

STEPHEN R. MALLORY.
SECRETARY OF THE NAVY OF THE CONFEDERATE STATES OF AMERICA. "TIS NOT IN MORTALS TO
COMMAND SUCCESS; BUT WE'LL DO MORE, SEMPRONIUS, WE'LL DESERVE IT.

JEFFERSON DAVIS
PRESIDENT OF THE CONFEDERATE STATES OF AMERICA.
SOLDIER, STATESMAN, PATRIOT, CHRISTIAN. THE ONLY MAN IN OUR NATION WITHOUT A
COUNTRY, YET TWENTY MILLION PEOPLE MOURN HIS DEATH.

At the time of the monument's erection and shortly after, Lee Square was adorned by some eight hundred cannonballs and two cannons purchased in 1891 by the ladies' association. Eventually the cannonballs disappeared, likely taken one by one, and four cannons from the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries were later placed in the square. In 1903, the ladies' association transferred responsibility of stewardship for Lee Park to the Pensacola Chapter of the United Daughters of the Confederacy. By the mid-twentieth century, Lee square had become so overgrown that the monument could barely be seen.¹⁰

Due to the location of Lee Square and the growing importance of automobile traffic, local officials began to discuss reconfiguration of the square in the 1930s. These discussions were overwhelmingly met with opposition and City Council continued discussions on the redesign for the next three decades. In 1964, however, City Council voted to repeal the 1890 ordinance which had placed Lee Square under the charge of the ladies' association and management of the square was transferred to the city. Sections of Palafox Street which formed the west and east boundaries of the square were soon repositioned through the park and the area was landscaped to its present configuration. As part of this project, brick stairs containing the names of thirteen Confederate States (eleven that seceded and two border states) were installed on the square's eastern slope and a concrete skirt was added at the monument's base.¹¹

While the monument at Lee Square was erected in part as a memorial for those who fought and died for the South, its message also commemorates a post-Reconstruction "Lost Cause" narrative. This dual message is evident when viewing the south main panel which highlights and celebrates "The Uncrowned Heroes of the Southern Confederacy," expressing their cause as inspirational and one that was believed to be justified. This unrepentant vindication of southern loss is a common theme of many Confederate monuments that were erected after Reconstruction (1865-1877) and during the era of Jim Crow laws (1877-1964). Its location along a main thoroughfare is also characteristic of this era of Confederate monuments, which were more often than not erected in public places to deliberately promote a daily message to those who passed by.

Is "The Confederate Monument" at Lee Square a "qualifying historic resource"?

Yes, the Confederate monument at Lee Square is a "qualifying historic resource" as it relates to the City Council policy titled, "Establishment, Naming and Preservation of Historical Resources". Per this policy, any proposal to name, rename, alter, establish,

move or remove a qualifying historical resource that is the property of the City of Pensacola, or is located on property owned by the City of Pensacola, will be presented to the City Council for consideration. To determine whether a resource is a qualifying historical resource, it must meet the following criteria:

- a) be associated with events that made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; and/or
- b) are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; and/or
- c) embody the distinctive characteristics of a type or period; and/or
- d) have yielded or may be likely to yield information important in our history.

The Confederate monument located at Lee Square meets all these criteria. However, this resource may not be considered eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). Ordinarily, properties or structures that are primarily commemorative in nature are not considered eligible per 36 CFR §60.4(f), unless they have their own exceptional significance. Because this monument focuses on commemorative notions and was erected in a place not associated with Confederate-related historical events during the Civil War, potentially eligible NRHP criteria are unlikely to be recognized.

Criterion a – be associated with events that made a significant contributing to the broad patterns of our history. The Confederate monument at Lee Square is associated with the memory of Civil War-related events, the era of Jim Crow laws, Civil Rights, and to the overall program of erecting Confederate monuments throughout the United States. Although controversial, these events have made significant contributions to our history. As a result, the Confederate monument at Lee Square meets criterion a.

Criterion b – are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past. The Confederate monument located at Lee Square is associated with Jefferson Davis, Edward Perry and Stephen Mallory who are historically significant people in our past. The monument also recognized “The Uncrowned Heroes of the Southern Confederacy” and “Our Confederate Dead” which include soldiers who lived, fought, and died in our country. As a result, the monument at Lee Square meets criterion b.

Criterion c – embody the distinctive characteristics of a type or period. The Confederate monument located at Lee Square does embody distinctive characteristics of

a type or period. Although the soldier statue atop the monument is the reproduction of a bronze figure erected in Alexandria, Virginia, the overall craftsmanship is one that is unique and excellent. The monument itself is also characteristic of many monuments that were created and erected during the era of Jim Crow laws. These monuments typically involve a patterned social element in which they are carefully planned to have maximum visibility at public locations that would amplify their message. These monuments often carry a message of the “Lost Cause” which is post-Reconstruction rhetoric in defense of a noble cause and the leadership of the Southern Confederacy. As a result, the monument at Lee Square meets criterion c.

Criterion d- have yielded or may be likely to yield information important in our history. The Confederate monument located at Lee Square yields or may be likely to yield information important in our history. Although this category is often reserved for archaeological sites, monuments can certainly provide insight into social landscapes, built environments and the ways in which individuals and groups interact with and react to those landscapes. Other elements associated with this criterion and to the monument could include studies on materials, construction methods, post-war art and expression, place-making, past and current sociopolitical theory, and more. As a result, the monument at Lee Square meets criterion d.

Continuation of staff report - staff considerations.

1. Is the Square in its current format equitable and representative to all the citizens of our community?

No. Lee Square in its current form is not equitable or representative to all the citizens of our community. As the first multiyear European settlement in the continental United States, Pensacola has over four hundred and sixty years of recorded human occupation. Before that, Native American groups lived here and thrived. Pensacola’s heritage is both multiethnic and multinational, and its present community is even more diverse than its history. Because of this, the city’s collective heritage is not defined by a singular group, event or ideal. The Confederate monument at Lee Square is a biased presentation of southern loss and its scale, location and message are intended to be daily remembrances to the Southern Confederacy, its leaders, and its cause. To many, the monument is an uncomfortable reminder of a complex and divided time in American history. Although the

Lee Square monument is part of our historical landscape, the square does not accurately or inclusively represent Pensacola's past or its vision for the future.

2. If no, can the Square be altered and made equitable to all parties of our community?

Yes. Lee Square can be altered and made equitable to all parties of our community. To truly make the Square inclusive, monuments and memorial statues dedicated to all of Pensacola's histories and diverse heritages would need to be constructed and erected. Ideally, these objects would need to meet the mass, scale, and craftsmanship of the current Confederate monument. The financial costs to achieve this effort is undoubtedly immeasurable and not financially feasible as it has the potential to cost millions of dollars, if not more.

After careful consideration, the most inclusive and realistic option for moving forward is the complete removal of the Confederate monument. While relocation of the monument is an option, safe storage of the monument until a historically and socially appropriate location becomes available may be the most responsible decision. Any proposed relocation of the large monument presents challenges and potential impacts to Pensacola's diverse neighborhoods and built environments. There are places where the relocation or donation of the Confederate soldier statue portion may be appropriate such as St. Johns Cemetery, Veterans Memorial Park Pensacola or to the UWF Historic Trust.

The opportunity to repurpose Lee Square for an accurate interpretation of Pensacola's history is also available. While preserving the monument in place is an option, any potential additions, park improvements, or historic markers will certainly be overshadowed by the large monument. As stated above, the erection of new monuments, commemorative statues, large art installations or busts is not advised. If any historical additions are to be made, staff recommends a small number of interpretive historic panels that outline Pensacola's rich and diverse history. These potential panels are discussed in the next section and as replacement options for the park.

If the monument is to be removed, it should be done so in a respectful, sensitive, and safe way. The consideration to remove the Confederate monument at Lee Square is not meant to demean or erase the memory of the brave men who fought and died for their families, communities, and livelihoods. As a diverse and increasingly progressive city, Pensacola must continue to reflect on an accurate and unbiased retelling of our past. We must acknowledge that the removal of controversial objects is not an act of regret or

aggression but a symbol of growth and inclusion as we accept opportunities to move forward and to become a stronger city.

While historic preservation seeks to preserve the historic built environment, our City and urban landscape is a living and evolving system. Loss is inevitable and historic preservationists understand and accept this. Monuments present a specific challenge as preservationists attempt to interpret complex meanings and (often) conflicting social values. While it is important to remember that even controversial artifacts, properties, and events may have historical significance and/or value, successful historic preservation is focused on retelling accurate histories through current interpretations of past events and actions.

3. If yes, how much would it cost to do so?

Interpretive panels and mounts such as those used for the Maritime Heritage Trail and the Colonial Archaeological Trail, cost approximately \$300-\$400 each (\$200-\$300 for the mount and approximately \$100 for the panel itself). Design of the panels can be conducted in-house or in partnership with local organizations such as the UWF Historic Trust and the Florida Public Archaeology Network. Options and ideas for potential markers are below.

Estimated costs to remove and/or reconfigure the monument is being conducted by the City's Public Works & Facilities Department.

Further considerations from staff.

1. Removal of the monument and replacement options for the park.

The potential removal of any historic resource should be conducted in a respectful, safe and sensitive manner. Great care should be taken to avoid damaging any part of a monument and potential disassembly (if possible) should be done in a way to minimize any visible damage or impact. Prior to possible removal, a thorough and current record of the monument's location and context within Lee Square should be made. This can be accomplished in the following ways:

- a) photograph and drone video recording of the monument and the current configuration of Lee Square;
- b) photogrammetry documentation of the monument (photographic measurements and data points to virtually recreate a 3D rendering of the monument);
- c) high-resolution photographs and 3D laser scanning of the monument panels.

As previously stated, staff does not advise the installation or erection of any new monuments, busts, statues, sculptures, or large works of art in place of the Confederate monument. Any replacement items should focus on an inclusive retelling of Pensacola's history. Possible options that include historical considerations include one or a combination of the following:

- a) Removal of the monument and the display of the Florida state flag in the center of the park. Cannons and concrete skirt to be removed or to remain.
- b) Removal of the monument and the display of Pensacola's five flags. Cannons and concrete skirt to be removed or to remain.
- c) Removal of the monument. Cannons and concrete skirt to be removed or to remain. In partnership with local and historical organizations, the City could create historical interpretive panels like the Maritime Heritage Trail and Colonial Archaeological Trail panels. These can be located either in the center of the square or within the park's west and east greenspaces. Staff and Members of the City Council should remember that Palafox Street is a main thoroughfare and that pedestrian access to the center of the square can be challenging. Ideally, the interpretive panels would contain text and images as an inclusive retelling of Pensacola's history. There could be any number of interpretive panels; but the fewer, the better as to not create sign clutter. As an example and if four panels were decided upon, panels could include the following broad ideas (please note that these are only suggestions to visualize interpretive options): 1) "Pensacola's First People" – a marker to highlight the area's Native American past and archaeology; 2) "Colonial and Historic Pensacola" – a marker containing a brief mention of Tristán de Luna (1559-1561) and a timeline from 1756 (construction of Spanish Fort San Miguel) to 1821 (transfer of Florida from Spain to the United States). This marker would showcase the city's Spanish, African, Creole, French and British heritage; 3) "Statehood to the Civil War" – a marker commemorating the growth of Pensacola's industries and laborers, Florida's secession, the Union fortification of Fort Clinch and the erection of the Confederate monument; and 4) "Post-Civil War and a Vision for the Future" – a marker to discuss Pensacola's turn-of-the-century economy and downtown area, World War I and II, Civil Rights and a final eulogy written by the Mayor or City Council that celebrates Pensacola's diverse heritage and a call for continued unity. Again, please note that the creation of markers is possible and that the above examples are conceptual.

- d) Removal of the monument and the concrete foundation for a greenspace and the planting of a "Unity Tree" and/or a single commemorative marker celebrating Pensacola's diverse heritage and history as well as a call for continued unity. Cannons to remain, be relocated or removed and placed in storage.
- e) Removal of the monument and the creation of a landscaped greenspace.
- f) Removal of the monument and the erection of a single Florida Historical Marker celebrating Pensacola's diverse cultures and heritage. Cannons and concrete skirt to be removed or to remain.

2. Partial removal/alternation and partial replacement options.

Partial removal/alternation could include one or a combination of the following options:

- a) Retention of the monument and removal of the Confederate soldier statue and/or panels. While this option is meant to repurpose the monument, the removal of any features has potential to damage the monument itself. However, the Confederate soldier statue could be relocated or donated to a museum, a cemetery or placed in Veterans Memorial Park Pensacola. While the relocation of the full monument is not advised (mentioned below), the relocation of the Confederate soldier statue may be more historically and socially appropriate. If successfully removed, the panels may be donated to UWF Historic Trust or other local organizations.
- b) Retention of the overall monument and removal of the obelisk/shaft. This option would leave the concrete skirt, the three-stepped base, the truncated pyramid containing the monument's text, and the Confederate soldier statue. While this option significantly decreases the height of the monument, it also creates easier access to the top of the monument which may be a safety concern.
- c) Retention of the overall monument, removal of the Confederate soldier statue and cover the panels with new plates or insets that contain text and/or art to highlight Pensacola's history. This option is like the above historical interpretive marker option. Instead of stand-alone markers, however, text and imagery would be located on the insets/replacement panels.

Recently, several Confederate monuments have been removed and/or relocated. For those that have been relocated, Confederate veteran plots in cemeteries are probably the most common destination. Others have found homes in veteran's parks among monuments to other American conflicts. However, many have been placed in storage, which is also appropriate until a more suitable location becomes available.

Possible locations for the relocation of the Confederate monument or any part of the Confederate monument should be considered very carefully. Consideration should be given to the visual and social impacts of such a prominent and large structure. Any decision to relocate the monument should also include the consideration of potential impacts to surrounding communities, historic properties, planned developments, etc. The intent, message, and scope of the monument must also be considered, and input from the community and any potentially impacted residents should be heard. Please note that while the Confederate monument partially memorializes the Confederate dead, it is not a funerary monument and its relocation to a historic cemetery may not be considered appropriate option for some. Relocation options and/or donation considerations for the Confederate monument or portions of the Confederate monument include:

- a) Relocate the monument to City storage for the time being.
- b) Donate the monument to a historic preservation organization, such as the UWF Historic Trust.
- c) If the panels are removed, the Perry panel might be donated to the First United Methodist Church, owner of the Perry Home.
- d) Relocation to St. John's Cemetery. St. John's Cemetery contains a number of military internments including those that took part in the Civil War. In fact, Edward Perry whose name is inscribed on the monument's west face is buried there. While St. John's Cemetery may appear to be the most historically appropriate placement, careful consideration should be given as to any visual or social impacts to existing burials, statues, and monuments within St. John's Cemetery as well as to the surrounding community and residents.
- e) Partial relocation to Veterans Memorial Park Pensacola. Veterans Memorial Park may be an appropriate location for the Confederate soldier statue portion only. Relocation of the full monument to this park is not advised since the monument's mass will overpower existing monuments and displays.
- f) Relocation to St. Michael's Cemetery. St. Michael's Cemetery is a state park and contains several Pensacola's colonial-period internments. Also, Stephen Mallory who is mentioned on the monument's north panel is buried here. Since St. Michael's Cemetery is a historical site unto itself, any out-of-context addition will likely damage the cemetery's historical integrity.
- g) Relocation to Barrancas National Cemetery. Civil War soldiers from both the North and the South are buried here and this may be a historically appropriate area.

However, the cemetery is managed by the National Cemetery Administration and the monument will likely not be accepted due to its scale.

3. No action option.

In place preservation is also an option. If the Confederate monument is decided to be left in place, we must accept that it does not accurately convey or memorialize Civil War history or the true sacrifice of those who fought and died for a cause they viewed as just. Historic interpretive panels could still be erected within the square; however, they would be overshadowed and likely overpowered by the existing monument.

Notes

1. Pensacola Ordinance. *An Ordinance to Fix the Names of Certain Streets and Florida Square*, June 4, 1887.
2. Chartrand, *Forts of the American Revolution 1775-83*. 2016; Manuel, *Images of American, Pensacola Bay: A Military History*.
3. Lees, *Recalling Deeds Immortal*, 71.
4. Florida Master Site File for 8ES1279 Lee Square, Pensacola.
5. Confederated Southern Memorial Association, *History of the Confederated Memorial Associations of the South*, 71-72.
6. Pensacola Ordinance. Ordinance No. 29-64, November 5, 1980.
7. Lees, *Recalling Deeds Immortal*, 67.
8. Confederated Southern Memorial Association. *History of the Confederated Memorial Associations of the South*, 71-74; Lees, *Recalling Deeds Immortal*, 68-69.
9. Confederated Southern Memorial Association, *History of the Confederated Memorial Associations of the South*, 74; Lees, *Recalling Deeds Immortal*, 69.
10. Lees, *Recalling Deeds Immortal*, 70-71
11. Lees, *Recalling Deeds Immortal*, 72.

ESTIMATE SHEET
Removal and store 06/17/20

NO.	ITEM		TOTAL COST
1	Permitting		\$1,500.00
2	Demo		
3	Scaffolding		\$5,000.00
4	Crane		\$8,500.00
5	Remove statue at top and create for travel		\$4,500.00
6	Removal of stone and crate for travel		\$35,000.00
7	Removal of interior structure		\$8,500.00
8	Demo of foundation		\$18,000.00
9	fill dirt		\$7,500.00
10	Landsacping		\$10,000.00
11	Transportation		\$5,000.00
12			
13	MOT and traffic control		\$5,000.00
14	Security provided by PPD		\$5,000.00
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
29			
30			
31			
32			
33			
34			
35			
36			
37			
38			
39			
40			
41			
42			
43			
44			
45			
46			
47			
48			
49			
50			
51			
52			
53			
54			
55			
56			
57			
58			
59			
60			
61			
62			
60			
61			
62			
63			
64			
65			
66			

CITY OF PENSACOLA
ENGINEERING DIVISION

ADD 5 %

GRAND TOTAL	\$113,500.00
CONTINGENCY	\$5,675.00
TOTAL	\$119,175.00

**ESTIMATE SHEET
Removal and Install 06/17/20**

NO.	ITEM		TOTAL COST
1	Permitting both demo and construction		\$8,500.00
2	Demo		
3	Scaffolding		\$5,000.00
4	Crane		\$8,500.00
5	Remove statue at top and create for travel		\$3,500.00
6	Removal of stone and crate for travel		\$30,000.00
7	Removal of interior structure		\$10,200.00
8	Demo of foundation		\$18,000.00
9	fill dirt		\$7,500.00
10	Landsacping		\$5,000.00
11			
12	Installation		
13	Transportation		\$5,000.00
14	Design and Engineering		\$12,500.00
15	Site Work		\$14,000.00
16	Foundation and slab		\$85,000.00
17	Structure		\$22,000.00
18	Stone work		\$45,000.00
19	Landscaping		\$8,500.00
20	Lighting		\$9,000.00
21	Scaffolding		\$5,000.00
22			
23	Security both demo and installation provided by PPD		\$5,000.00
24	MOT and traffic control		\$5,000.00
25			
26			
27			
28			
29			
30			
31			
32			
33			
34			
35			
36			
37			
38			
39			
40			
41			
42			
43			
44			
45			
46			
47			
48			
49			
50			
51			
52			
53			
54			
55			
56			
57			
58			
59			
60			
61			
62			
60			
61			
62			
63			
64			
65			
66			

CITY OF PENSACOLA
ENGINEERING DIVISION

ADD 5 %

GRAND TOTAL	\$312,200.00
CONTINGENCY	\$15,610.00
TOTAL	\$327,810.00

ESTIMATE SHEET
Remove top and cover panels 06/17/2020

NO.	ITEM		TOTAL COST
1	Grainite panels to cover existing and installation 4		\$15,000.00
2	Cover or remove wording at base		\$4,500.00
3	Scaffolding		\$4,500.00
4	Crane		\$3,500.00
5	Remove statue at top and create for travel		\$3,500.00
6	Transportation		\$2,500.00
7			
8	Security provided by PPD		\$5,000.00
9	MOT and traffic control		\$5,000.00
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
29			
30			
31			
32			
33			
34			
35			
36			
37			
38			
39			
40			
41			
42			
43			
44			
45			
46			
47			
48			
49			
50			
51			
52			
53			
54			
55			
56			
57			
58			
59			
60			
61			
62			
60			
61			
62			
63			
64			
65			
66			

CITY OF PENSACOLA
 ENGINEERING DIVISION

ADD 5 %

GRAND TOTAL	\$43,500.00
CONTINGENCY	\$2,175.00
TOTAL	\$45,675.00



City of Pensacola

222 West Main Street
Pensacola, FL 32502

Memorandum

File #: 20-00337

City Council

7/14/2020

LEGISLATIVE ACTION ITEM

SPONSOR: Grover C. Robinson, IV, Mayor

SUBJECT:

REQUEST FOR THE RENAMING OF LEE SQUARE TO FLORIDA SQUARE

RECOMMENDATION:

That City Council approve the request to rename Lee Square back to Florida Square.

HEARING REQUIRED: No Hearing Required

SUMMARY:

The Mayor requests to rename Lee Square to Florida Square for several reasons -

- Based on the Watson Survey from 1806, there were three parks in North Hill - Florida Square, Georgia Square, and Alabama Square. Only one of them has been renamed.
- The "Uncrowned Heroes of the Southern Confederacy" monument was originally placed in Florida Square. The square was not renamed until many years later.
- Next year Florida celebrates 200 years of being part of the United States. Florida Square is more inclusive of all of our citizens.
- Florida Square was renamed Lee Square after Robert E. Lee years after his death. According to history, he did not feel it was appropriate to name something in his honor.

PRIOR ACTION:

June 18, 2020 - The Parks and Recreation Board approved the recommendation to rename Lee Square to Florida Square.

FUNDING:

N/A

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

None

CITY ATTORNEY REVIEW: Yes

6/25/2020

STAFF CONTACT:

Keith Wilkins, City Administrator
Kerrith Fiddler, Deputy City Administrator - Community Development
Brian Cooper, Parks and Recreation Director

ATTACHMENTS:

- 1) Unapproved June 18, 2020 Parks and Recreation Board Minutes
- 2) Staff Memo regarding Florida Square 1858 Map
- 3) 1858 Map of Florida Square

PRESENTATION: No

Rename Lee Square

Mayor Robinson presented the request to change the name of Lee Square to Florida Square. He presented a map of North Hill done in 1806 by Watson Survey. There were three parks in North Hill, Florida Square, Georgia Square, and Alabama Square. The only one whose name has been changed is Florida Square to Lee Square. The monument was in Florida Square for a long time before the name change.

Next year Florida will be celebrating 200 years of being a part of the United States. By renaming the square, the name would be more inclusive of all of our citizens. The square was renamed long after Robert E. Lee's death. Lee mentioned that he did not want something like that named after him, did not feel it would not be appropriate.

Member Escobar-Ryan asked what would be presented at the July 16 City Council meeting, renaming the park, or removing the Confederate monument? Mayor Robinson hopes to discuss both at once.

Member Del Gallo made the motion to rename Lee Square [to] Florida Square. Member Harrison seconded the motion. A general oral vote was taken. The vote passed 8-0 (Member Garza absent). There were no requests from the public to speak on the issue.

MEMORANDUM

TO: Ericka Burnett, City Clerk
FROM: Brian Cooper, Parks and Recreation Director *BC*
SUBJECT: Rename Lee Square to Florida Square
DATE: June 12, 2020

I have been asked to begin the process of changing the name of Lee Square back to its original name of Florida Square. In advance of the 200th Celebration of becoming a part of the United States in July 2021, we would like the name to be more inclusive to all of our citizens. Also, we would like to restore the original historic name of the square to represent our home state, Florida.

RECEIVED
JUN 15 2020
BY: *[Signature]*

Heidi Thorsen

From: Brian Cooper
Sent: Friday, June 12, 2020 12:20 PM
To: Heidi Thorsen
Subject: FW: Renaming Lee Square to Florida Square

Please print. And prepare a short memo to the clerk

Sent from my Verizon, Samsung Galaxy smartphone

----- Original message -----

From: "Grover C. Robinson, IV" <GRobinson@cityofpensacola.com>
Date: 6/12/20 12:07 PM (GMT-06:00)
To: Brian Cooper <bcooper@cityofpensacola.com>
Cc: Kerrith Fiddler <KFiddler@cityofpensacola.com>, Keith Wilkins <KWilkins@cityofpensacola.com>, Don Kraher <DKraher@cityofpensacola.com>, Susan Woolf <swoolf@cityofpensacola.com>
Subject: Renaming Lee Square to Florida Square

Dear Brian,

Please begin whatever process to change the name of Lee Square to Florida Square. Please be sure to take all steps to prepare the measure for presentation to the City Council on July 16, 2020. This includes timely presentation to all citizens boards.

To purpose of this request is twofold. First, the purpose in provide a name which is more appropriate and inclusive to all of our citizens in advance of our 200th Celebration as part of the United States in July 2021. The second is to restore the original and historic name of the square to represent our home state, Florida.

Please begin this process and contact me if you have any questions. Thank you for your time and assistance.

Grover

Sent from my iPhone

MEMORANDUM

Date: June 29, 2020

Re: 1858 Map of Pensacola Showing Florida Square

During staff discussions on the potential renaming of R. E. Lee Square to Florida Square, staff was asked to research whether or not the name "Florida Square" was associated with Florida's secession from the United States of America in 1861. The attached 1858 "Plan of Lots in the City of Pensacola" map (courtesy of the UWF Historic Trust Archives) clearly depicts Florida Square as existing (or at least as planned) and named as such prior to the Civil War. As a result, the name, "Florida Square", does not appear to be in recognition of Florida's role or actions during the Civil War.

