



## **MINUTES OF THE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD**

**October 15, 2020**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Board Member Fogarty, Board Member Mead, Board Member Ramos, Board Member Salter, Board Member Spencer, Board Member Villegas, Board Member Yee

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** None

**STAFF PRESENT:** Historic Preservation Planner Harding, Board Advisor Pristera, Assistant City Attorney Lindsay, Planning Technician Hargett, Network Engineer Johnston

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Tim Richardson, Chris Vail, Dan Girardin, Carter Quina

### **CALL TO ORDER / QUORUM PRESENT**

Historic Preservation Planner Harding called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.

**SWEARING IN NEW APPOINTMENTS AND REAPPOINTMENTS** – Jordan Yee, Yuri Ramos and Brian Spencer were sworn in by the Clerk's Office as new Board members; Board Member Salter and Board Member Fogarty were sworn in for reappointments.

**BOARD ELECTION OF OFFICERS** – Historic Preservation Planner Harding explained the duties of the Chairperson and the pre-ARB meetings to discuss upcoming items to be presented to the Board. The Vice Chairperson would chair the meetings with the same responsibility when the Chairperson was unavailable. He also explained unlike other boards, the ARB Chairperson could make and second motions. Board Member Fogarty nominated Board Member Salter for Chairperson, and the Board voted unanimously to elect him as Chairperson. Board Member Villegas nominated Board Member Mead for Vice Chairperson, and the Board voted unanimously to elect him as Vice Chairperson.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**Board Member Mead made a motion to approve the September 30, 2020 minutes, seconded by Board Member Fogarty, and it carried unanimously.**

Chairperson Salter asked if there were any attendees for the Open Forum, and staff explained the public was allowed to participate virtually and express comments or ask questions through email, however, none had been received.

**OPEN FORUM** - None

**NEW BUSINESS**

**Item 1**

**413 W. Brainerd Street**

**NHPD**

**Non-Contributing Structure**

**PR-1AAA**

**Action taken: Approved.**

Tim Richardson is requesting approval to remove an existing rear wheelchair ramp at the back door and to replace it with a composite wood deck suitable for outdoor entertaining. The deck will be fully contained within the rear yard and will not be seen from the street. Existing and proposed site plans and elevations were provided to the Board. Since the memo was produce, Mr. Richardson has asked to change the decking and stair materials to Trex decking. North Hill had no objections to this request.

Mr. Richardson presented to the Board and stated the top of the railing would be 40" in height. Board Member Ramos asked if the applicant had considered more horizontal lines which were the standard aesthetics for the mid-century look, but he had no issues with the proposal. **Board Member Spencer made a motion to approve, seconded by Board Member Mead, and it carried unanimously.**

**Item 2**

**426 E. Intendencia St**

**PHD**

**Non-Contributing Structure**

**HR-1 / Wood Cottages**

**Action taken: Approved with abbreviated review.**

Dan Girardin (SMP Architecture) is requesting approval for the following changes to a noncontributing single-family residence:

- Construct a 176 s.f. addition to the southwest corner of the primary structure;
- Add a new driveway connection from the existing garage to a private alleyway;
- Relocate the existing garage doors to the north side of the accessory structure;
- Extend and replace the north side porch floor with composite wood decking;
- Remove the inner concrete drive and enclose the existing fence with in-kind materials;
- Add a paver patio and new covered exterior grilling station;
- Re-paint the porch ceilings "Ceiling Bright White"; and
- Remove and replace exterior wood siding with Hardieplank lap siding and trim.

Staff explained the Aragon HOA provided an approval letter for access to the alley; the property was not actually in Aragon, but the rear abuts to a privately owned and maintained alley which is maintained by that HOA.

Board Member Spencer recused himself as an employee of SMP. Mr. Girardin presented to the Board. Staff confirmed the application as presented did not require any variances, and Advisor Pristera and staff were available to answer any questions from new Board members regarding non-contributing or contributing structures. Board Member Ramos asked about the driveway requirements, and staff advised the Code states materials that are required for the historic districts, but the Board could deviate from those. He suggested evaluating by looking at what was already on the site and what was present in the historical

district. Aerial photos of other driveways in the area were furnished to the Board. Staff read the driveway requirements listed in the Code. Mr. Girardin stated the new driveway would be from the alleyway to the new garage in the rear. Board Member Villegas stated what was being proposed was an improvement but questioned placing the garage doors on the north side. Chairperson Salter addressed the side elevation of the screened porch roofline and the siding being continuous. Board Member Mead addressed the window transoms, and Mr. Girardin stated the owner had a standalone bar being placed underneath the first window transom, with the other window transom letting in more light to the dining room. Board Member asked if there was another way to avoid the long high horizontal windows when verticality is preferred in the Code. Mr. Girardin stated they could keep the transom and introduce a false shutter to balance it out. Chairperson Salter suggested reducing the width of the windows, using some trim work to read as a whole unit. Board Member Yee advised he had seen other structures in historic areas which had transom windows above shutters that were likely false, but it at least maintained a proportion of something that was vertical and did not look as out of place; the width in this case was too great. **Board Member Mead made a motion to approve with modification of the standalone transom elements on the addition to be the same width as the reused center windows, and that some trim treatment to integrate those elements be provided for an abbreviated review. Board Member Villegas seconded the motion, and it carried unanimously.**

**Item 3**

**126 W. Jackson Street**

**NHPD**

**Contributing Structure**

**PR-2**

**Action taken: Approved with abbreviated review.**

Chris Vail (Urban Infill Co.) is requesting approval for exterior renovations to a contributing structure. The work includes the following items:

- Remove several windows from the rear as well as a door from the east side;
- Install smaller fixed windows in two showers;
- Construct a new rear porch;
- Install an awning over the back door and basement stairs, and
- Replace shingles on the existing carriage house.

Staff advised that North Hill had no issues with the project. Mr. Vail addressed the Board and clarified which windows were being replaced; materials would match the existing. The rear awning would cover the landing as well as the entrance to the stairs under the landing. Mr. Vail stated the structure had multiple types of brick, but the pattern would not be a problem. Advisor Pristera addressed the large circular driveway and landscaping. Mr. Vail advised there had never been a driveway on the front, and they proposed to tie into the existing apron and curb cut for the parking pad. He indicated the driveway material would consist of concrete. Board Member Yee asked had they considered supporting the rear roof similarly to the roof on the carriage house. Mr. Vail stated he felt the shed roof was appropriate for the carriage house, but he could agree to this. Board Member Spencer understood the value of having the existing driveway cut but asked if a landscape plan was required for a project of this scope. Staff advised that typically for new construction projects, landscaping is a part of a complete application, and it could be submitted as an abbreviated review. Board Member Ramos wanted additional information on the awning.

**Board Member Spencer made a motion to approve with an abbreviated view for the**



**Board Member Spencer made a motion to approve with the understanding that Mr. Quina would return with an abbreviated review for colors/signage; that the rendering was lacking one awning to the entrance of the larger bay addition; it had been established that this building abutted a noted historical structure and was a simple box which had undergone layers of adaptation and different not-so-creative solutions, and there was no reason to make it more complicated. Board Member Mead amended the motion to include the awning, which Mr. Quina described for the smaller bay, to be the width of the second bay. The amendment was accepted, and the motion was seconded by Board Member Mead. Chairperson Salter stated he appreciated the efforts to reuse the existing structure that was in questionable condition to create an outdoor venue using the streetscape. The motion then carried unanimously.**

**Item 7**

**1009 N. Reus Street**

**NHPD  
PR-1AAA**

**Contributing Structure**

**Action taken: Approved with abbreviated review.**

Eric Mead is requesting approval to change out the three casement wood windows on the upper front elevation. The current windows are damaged and leaking. The proposed metal clad windows will be the same dimension, same pattern with divided lites and in white.

Historic Preservation Planner Harding explained North Hill was not able to furnish comments since this was an abbreviated review forwarded to the full Board. Handouts were provided to the Board indicating the condition of the windows.

Mr. Mead presented to the Board and stated the windows were not original to the house, and there was no meaningful way to rebuild them. He advised the regular standards called for replacing in-kind if the overall form and detailing are still evident; if using the same kind of material is not feasible, a compatible suitable replacement may be considered. He felt the metal clad windows would be more durable for the most exposed elevation on the house. He also provided the sustainability guidelines for historic structures which refer to installing compatible and energy efficient replacement windows which match the appearance, size, etc. He advised the windows proposed would be single glazed. He noted that the Historic District was stricter than the NHPD, but what they had requested here was in line with the law and spirit of the Code. He indicated the windows were legitimate push-out windows, and there should be no visible difference. Chairperson Salter was concerned that the windows acted like two doors coming together, and where they come together, they overlap, and when fully opened there was no mullion. Mr. Mead stated there should not be a mullion with the proposed product (French casements with no center). He also indicated the only screens would be on the interior. He confirmed three sets of windows on the east elevation were being replaced. Board Member Villegas addressed the trim, and Mr. Mead stated he wanted to save the brick mold and match the paint to the trim. **Board Member Ramos made a motion to approve as proposed, seconded by Board Member Fogarty. Board Member Villegas amended the motion to maintain the existing trim, and if there was a foreseeable problem, an abbreviated review be brought forth to clarify. The amendment was accepted, and the motion carried unanimously.**

**DISCUSSION:** Historic Preservation Planner Harding thanked the Board and welcomed the

new Board members and stated he looked forward to working with them. Board Member Mead suggested providing affirmative direction to applicants to pull up the reference to the standards to be able to speak to them and determine how they apply. Staff advised this could be added to the application form to assist applicants and Board members. Chairperson Salter thanked the Board for the opportunity to serve as Chairperson.

**ADJOURNMENT** – With no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:54 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Harding', written in a cursive style.

Historic Preservation Planner Harding  
Secretary to the Board